

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF SOUTH DAKOTA  
WESTERN DIVISION

LEROY DENEKE,

Plaintiff,

v.

MENARD, INC.,

Defendant.

)  
) Case No. 5:21-cv-5068  
)  
)

)  
) **NOTICE OF REMOVAL**  
)  
)  
)  
)

Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 1441, and 1446, Defendant, Menard, Inc., (“Menard”) by and through Katelyn A. Cook of Gunderson, Palmer, Nelson and Ashmore, LLP, its attorneys, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1441(a) and (b) and 1446, respectfully files this Notice of Removal, removing this action from the Seventh Judicial Circuit Court of Pennington County, South Dakota in which the action is now pending to the United States District Court for the District of South Dakota. In support of this Removal, Defendant Menard presents the following discussion of fact and legal argument.

**I. VENUE IS PROPER IN THIS DISTRICT.**

1. Plaintiff Leroy Deneke filed a Complaint against Defendant Menard in the Seventh Judicial Circuit Court of Pennington County, South Dakota (the “State Court Action”). *See* Exhibit 1.

2. This Court is the proper venue because the United States District Court for the District of South Dakota, Western District, is the district court “embracing the place where the action is pending.” 28 U.S.C. § 1441(a).

**II. ATTACHMENTS.**

3. A true and correct copy of the docket sheet from the State Court Action is attached hereto as Exhibit 2. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1446(a), a legible copy of all process, pleadings, and orders filed of record in the State Court Action are attached hereto as Exhibit 3.

**III. THIS NOTICE OF REMOVAL IS TIMELY FILED.**

4. Defendant Menard was served with the Summons and Complaint on September 13, 2021.

5. This Notice of Removal is being filed within thirty (30) days after service on Defendant Mendard. Accordingly, this Notice of Removal is timely filed within the requirement of 28 U.S.C. § 1446(b).

**IV. SUBJECT MATTER JURISDICTION.**

6. This Court has original subject matter jurisdiction over this action pursuant to the diversity jurisdiction statute codified at 28 U.S.C. § 1332, which provides, in part, that the “district court shall have original jurisdiction of all civil actions where the matter in controversy exceeds the sum or value of \$75,000, exclusive of interest and costs, and is between ... citizens of different states.” 28 U.S.C. § 1332(a)(1).

**A. Diversity of Citizenship.**

7. Plaintiff Deneke is resident of Pennington County, South Dakota. *See* Exhibit 1, Complaint at ¶ 1.

8. Defendant Menard is a Wisconsin corporation with its principal place of business in Eau Claire, Wisconsin. *See* Exhibit 4, Wisconsin Department of Financial Institutions; *see also* Exhibit 1, Complaint at ¶ 2.

9. Accordingly, there is complete diversity if citizenship in this matter because the Plaintiff (a South Dakota resident) and Defendant Menard (a Wisconsin corporation) are citizens of different states.

**B. Amount in Controversy is Met.**

10. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1446(c), the sum demanded in the initial pleading is deemed the amount in controversy. The United States Supreme Court has explained that “[t]he general federal rule has long been to decide what the amount in controversy is from the complaint itself, unless it appears or is in some way shown that the amount stated in the complaint is not claimed ‘in good faith.’” *Horton v. Liberty Mut. Ins. Co.*, 367 U.S. 348, 353 (1961); *Larkin v. Brown*, 41 F.3d 387, 388 (8th Cir. 1994) (jurisdictional amount in controversy requirement satisfied by complaint that in good faith alleges damages exceeding jurisdictional amount).

11. As expressly set forth the Plaintiff’s Complaint, the amount in controversy in this matter exceeds the sum of \$75,000, meeting the requirements of 28 U.S.C. § 1332(a). The Complaint alleges negligence and states that Plaintiff has already incurred One Hundred Eighty Eight Thousand, One Hundred Twenty-Eight and 19/100 Dollars in damages. Thus, the amount in controversy is plainly \$188,128.19, a sum which greatly exceeds \$75,000.00. The amount is controversy requirement is easily met on the face of the Plaintiff’s Complaint.

**V. THE OTHER REQUIREMENTS FOR REMOVAL ARE SATISFIED.**

12. A Notice of Filing Notice of Removal, with a copy of this Notice of Removal attached, will promptly be filed with the Clerk of the Seventh Judicial Circuit Court of Pennington County, South Dakota.

13. Written notice of the filing of this Notice of Removal will be given to Plaintiff as required by law.

14. The allegations of this Notice of Removal are true and correct and this cause is within the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the District of South Dakota.

15. If any question arises as to the propriety of the removal of this civil action, Defendant Menard requests the opportunity to present a brief in support of its position that this civil action is removable to this Court.

Dated: October 13, 2021.

GUNDERSON, PALMER, NELSON  
& ASHMORE, LLP

By: /s/ Katelyn A. Cook

Katelyn A. Cook  
*Attorneys for Defendant*  
P.O. Box 8045  
Rapid City, SD 57709  
Telephone: (605) 342-1078  
Fax: (605) 342-9503  
E-mail: [katie@gpna.com](mailto:katie@gpna.com)

JS 44 (Rev. 04/21)

**CIVIL COVER SHEET**

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)

**I. (a) PLAINTIFFS**

LeRoy Deneke

**DEFENDANTS**

Menard, Inc.

(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff Pennington  
(EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)

County of Residence of First Listed Defendant  
(IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY)

NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED.

(c) Attorneys (Firm Name, Address, and Telephone Number)

Michael Hickey John Stanton Dorsey  
Bangs McCullen Butler Foye & Simmons Whiting Hagg Hagg Dorsey & Hagg  
PO Box 2670 PO Box 8008  
Rapid City, SD 57709 Rapid City, SD 57709

Attorneys (If Known)  
Katelyn A. Cook  
PO Box 8045  
Rapid City, SD 57709

**II. BASIS OF JURISDICTION** (Place an "X" in One Box Only)

- ☐ 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff
- ☐ 2 U.S. Government Defendant
- ☐ 3 Federal Question (U.S. Government Not a Party)
- ☒ 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)

**III. CITIZENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PARTIES** (Place an "X" in One Box for Plaintiff and One Box for Defendant)

- |   |                                       |                            |   |                            |                                       |
|---|---------------------------------------|----------------------------|---|----------------------------|---------------------------------------|
|   | PTF                                   | DEF                        |   | PTF                        | DEF                                   |
| Citizen of This State                   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 1 | <input type="checkbox"/> 1 | Incorporated or Principal Place of Business in This State     | <input type="checkbox"/> 4 | <input type="checkbox"/> 4            |
| Citizen of Another State                | <input type="checkbox"/> 2            | <input type="checkbox"/> 2 | Incorporated and Principal Place of Business in Another State | <input type="checkbox"/> 5 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 5 |
| Citizen or Subject of a Foreign Country | <input type="checkbox"/> 3            | <input type="checkbox"/> 3 | Foreign Nation  | <input type="checkbox"/> 6 | <input type="checkbox"/> 6            |

**IV. NATURE OF SUIT** (Place an "X" in One Box Only)

Click here for: Nature of Suit Code Descriptions.

CONTRACT	TORTS	FORFEITURE/PENALTY	BANKRUPTCY	OTHER STATUTES	
<input type="checkbox"/> 110 Insurance <input type="checkbox"/> 120 Marine <input type="checkbox"/> 130 Miller Act <input type="checkbox"/> 140 Negotiable Instrument <input type="checkbox"/> 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment <input type="checkbox"/> 151 Medicare Act <input type="checkbox"/> 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans) <input type="checkbox"/> 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits <input type="checkbox"/> 160 Stockholders' Suits <input type="checkbox"/> 190 Other Contract <input type="checkbox"/> 195 Contract Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 196 Franchise	<b>PERSONAL INJURY</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 310 Airplane <input type="checkbox"/> 315 Airplane Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 320 Assault, Libel & Slander <input type="checkbox"/> 330 Federal Employers' Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 340 Marine <input type="checkbox"/> 345 Marine Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 350 Motor Vehicle <input type="checkbox"/> 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 360 Other Personal Injury <input type="checkbox"/> 362 Personal Injury - Medical Malpractice	<b>PERSONAL INJURY</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 367 Health Care/Pharmaceutical Personal Injury Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability <b>PERSONAL PROPERTY</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 370 Other Fraud <input type="checkbox"/> 371 Truth in Lending <input type="checkbox"/> 380 Other Personal Property Damage <input type="checkbox"/> 385 Property Damage Product Liability	<input type="checkbox"/> 625 Drug Related Seizure of Property 21 USC 881 <input type="checkbox"/> 690 Other <b>LABOR</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 710 Fair Labor Standards Act <input type="checkbox"/> 720 Labor/Management Relations <input type="checkbox"/> 740 Railway Labor Act <input type="checkbox"/> 751 Family and Medical Leave Act <input type="checkbox"/> 790 Other Labor Litigation <input type="checkbox"/> 791 Employee Retirement Income Security Act <b>IMMIGRATION</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 462 Naturalization Application <input type="checkbox"/> 465 Other Immigration Actions	<input type="checkbox"/> 422 Appeal 28 USC 158 <input type="checkbox"/> 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 <b>INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 820 Copyrights <input type="checkbox"/> 830 Patent <input type="checkbox"/> 835 Patent - Abbreviated New Drug Application <input type="checkbox"/> 840 Trademark <input type="checkbox"/> 880 Defend Trade Secrets Act of 2016 <b>SOCIAL SECURITY</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 861 HIA (1395ff) <input type="checkbox"/> 862 Black Lung (923) <input type="checkbox"/> 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) <input type="checkbox"/> 864 SSID Title XVI <input type="checkbox"/> 865 RSI (405(g)) <b>FEDERAL TAX SUITS</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff or Defendant) <input type="checkbox"/> 871 IRS—Third Party 26 USC 7609	<input type="checkbox"/> 375 False Claims Act <input type="checkbox"/> 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a)) <input type="checkbox"/> 400 State Reapportionment <input type="checkbox"/> 410 Antitrust <input type="checkbox"/> 430 Banks and Banking <input type="checkbox"/> 450 Commerce <input type="checkbox"/> 460 Deportation <input type="checkbox"/> 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations <input type="checkbox"/> 480 Consumer Credit (15 USC 1681 or 1692) <input type="checkbox"/> 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act <input type="checkbox"/> 490 Cable/Sat TV <input type="checkbox"/> 850 Securities/Commodities/Exchange <input type="checkbox"/> 890 Other Statutory Actions <input type="checkbox"/> 891 Agricultural Acts <input type="checkbox"/> 893 Environmental Matters <input type="checkbox"/> 895 Freedom of Information Act <input type="checkbox"/> 896 Arbitration <input type="checkbox"/> 899 Administrative Procedure Act/Review or Appeal of Agency Decision <input type="checkbox"/> 950 Constitutionality of State Statutes
<b>REAL PROPERTY</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 210 Land Condemnation <input type="checkbox"/> 220 Foreclosure <input type="checkbox"/> 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment <input type="checkbox"/> 240 Torts to Land <input type="checkbox"/> 245 Tort Product Liability <input type="checkbox"/> 290 All Other Real Property	<b>CIVIL RIGHTS</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 440 Other Civil Rights <input type="checkbox"/> 441 Voting <input type="checkbox"/> 442 Employment <input type="checkbox"/> 443 Housing/Accommodations <input type="checkbox"/> 445 Amer. w/Disabilities - Employment <input type="checkbox"/> 446 Amer. w/Disabilities - Other <input type="checkbox"/> 448 Education	<b>PRISONER PETITIONS</b> <b>Habeas Corpus:</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 463 Alien Detainee <input type="checkbox"/> 510 Motions to Vacate Sentence <input type="checkbox"/> 530 General <input type="checkbox"/> 535 Death Penalty <b>Other:</b> <input type="checkbox"/> 540 Mandamus & Other <input type="checkbox"/> 550 Civil Rights <input type="checkbox"/> 555 Prison Condition <input type="checkbox"/> 560 Civil Detainee - Conditions of Confinement			

**V. ORIGIN** (Place an "X" in One Box Only)

- ☐ 1 Original Proceeding ☒ 2 Removed from State Court ☐ 3 Remanded from Appellate Court ☐ 4 Reinstated or Reopened ☐ 5 Transferred from Another District (specify) ☐ 6 Multidistrict Litigation - Transfer ☐ 8 Multidistrict Litigation - Direct File

**VI. CAUSE OF ACTION**

Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you are filing (Do not cite jurisdictional statutes unless diversity):

28 USC 1332

Brief description of cause:

Negligence

**VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:**

☐ CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER RULE 23, F.R.Cv.P.

DEMAND \$

CHECK YES only if demanded in complaint:

JURY DEMAND: ☒ Yes ☐ No**VIII. RELATED CASE(S) IF ANY**

(See instructions):

JUDGE

DOCKET NUMBER

DATE

10/13/2021

SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY OF RECORD

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY

RECEIPT #

AMOUNT

APPLYING IFP

JUDGE

MAG. JUDGE